Planning and Development Services Management Board  
Meeting Minutes: April 21, 2016

Chairman Tom Litzler called the monthly business meeting of the Planning and Development Services Management Board to order at 4:02 PM in the Commission Chambers of the PDS Building in Fort Mitchell. Attendance of members was as follows.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Present</th>
<th>Absent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chairman Tom Litzler</td>
<td>May 2014 through April 2016</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vice Chairman Paul Meier</td>
<td>May 2014 through April 2016</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sherry Carran</td>
<td>May 2015 through April 2017</td>
<td>4:07</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bill Goetz</td>
<td>May 2014 through April 2016</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark Kreimborg</td>
<td>May 2015 through April 2017</td>
<td>4:09</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chris Moriconi</td>
<td>May 2014 through April 2016</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Beth Sewell</td>
<td>May 2015 through April 2017</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Also present were: Matt Mattone, Mayor of Park Hills; Garry Edmondson, Legal Counsel; Jan Crabb, PHR, Finance/HR Administrator; Nicole Cullum, CB, Accountant; Scott Hiles, CPC, Director of Infrastructure Engineering; Dennis Andrew Gordon, FAICP, Executive Director; and Lori Remley, Administrative Assistant.

Chairman Litzler asked for a moment of silence and then led the Pledge of Allegiance. After Ms. Remley called the roll, he asked that the record reflect that a quorum was present.

**ACCEPTANCE OF AGENDA**

Chairman Litzler asked if there were any changes to the agenda. With none, Mr. Goetz made a motion to accept the agenda as presented; Commissioner Sewell seconded the motion. A voice vote found unanimous approval.

Chairman Litzler asked if there were any comments from the public and noted that there were none.
ONGOING BUSINESS

Chairman Litzler asked if the minutes of the March 17, 2016 business meeting were acceptable or if anyone had any additions/corrections.

With no changes reported, Chairman Litzler asked if there was a motion with regard to the minutes. Mr. Goetz made a motion to accept the minutes of the March 17, 2016 business meeting as presented; Mr. Moriconi seconded the motion. Chairman Litzler asked for a roll call vote on the motion which found Board Members Goetz, Moriconi, Sewell, Meier, and Chairman Litzler in favor of the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Ms. Crabb provided the March monthly financial report for the period ending March 31, 2016 and stated that there were two budget exceptions – mileage reimbursement and LINK-GIS Data.

Ms. Crabb then advised members that fee-based revenue ended the month ahead of projections and that revenues are up approximately 38.9% over where they were last March.

Mayor Carran (4:07 PM) and Mr. Kreimborg (4:09 PM) joined the meeting.

Discussion regarding the two bonds and mileage reimbursement rate ($0.54/mile) followed. Chairman Litzler asked for a motion regarding the financial reports. Mr. Goetz made a motion to accept the March 2016 financial reports subject to audit; Mayor Meier seconded the motion. Chairman Litzler asked for a roll call vote on the motion which found Board Members Goetz, Meier, Moriconi, Sewell, Carran, Kreimborg, and Chairman Litzler in favor of the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

Chairman Litzler asked for a report from legal counsel. Mr. Edmondson stated that there was nothing new regarding PDS. However, he advised members that there were a couple of lawsuits filed against the Kenton County Joint Code Enforcement Board out of Villa Hills. He stated that a lawsuit was also filed against the Kenton County Board of Adjustment and PDS would be dismissed from this action.

Chairman Litzler asked for a report from the executive director. Mr. Gordon stated that the most recent MapLAB project topic focused on the fourth anniversary of the Piner tornado. He indicated that the map was being featured at two South Kenton County Citizens Group meetings that were being held today at Piner Baptist Church. Mr. Gordon provided background regarding the development of the map and the collection of the data used.

Mr. Gordon provided members an update regarding Donna Bresser. He stated that shortly after her retirement, Ms. Bresser broke her ankle and, after several surgeries, doctors made the decision that it would be best to amputate her left foot. A card was then circulated for members to sign.
Mr. Gordon updated members on recent meetings with the Kenton County Planning Commission’s executive committee. He stated that, after a year of work, the amendments to the bylaws had been approved by the full commission. Additionally, the executive committee has met with the auditors and looked at its fees. The bylaws committee recommended and the full commission voted to leave the fees alone due to the funding arrangement with PDS. The exception to this are the inspection fees for Infrastructure Engineering. Mr. Gordon indicated that the committee reviewed the process, determined that it was overly cumbersome and delegated the responsibility to PDS. Everything, inspections and setting fees, will be handled through PDS like it used to be. Discussion regarding delegation of these duties followed.

Mayor Meier excused himself from the meeting at 4:30 PM and stated that he would return as soon as possible.

Mr. Gordon pointed out the meeting dates noted at the bottom of the agenda. A brief discussion regarding Fort Mitchell code enforcement followed.

Chairman Litzler asked for reports from committees and members of the Board. With no other reports, Chairman Litzler updated members on the recent meeting of the Long Term Debt Review Committee. He stated that he, Mayor Meier and Mayor Mattone along with former member/Treasurer, Dick Spoor met with staff to discuss the current bonds and whether there was any benefit to refinancing or paying down the debt sooner. He indicated that after reviewing various options, it was the committee’s recommendation to stay where they are without any plans to pay down the debt unless the rate goes up. He indicated that the current rate is extremely low (1.26%) and the added fees add only a percent to that. Chairman Litzler explained the review and the thought process that went into the committee’s recommendation. Following discussion, Commissioner Sewell recommended that the committee be kept intact and that they look at the rate annually. Chairman Litzler agreed and stated that the committee would look at the rate each year prior to the budget process.

NEW BUSINESS

Chairman Litzler asked for staff’s presentation on a proposed process for reviewing and prioritizing future small area studies/planning initiative requests, to include discussion on the required match. Ms. Randall provided members with a handout and background regarding the process. In an effort to help prioritize projects an application form and project evaluation form have been developed. Ms. Randall reviewed the proposed scoring sheet and stated that points are awarded on the relevance of the project to Direction 2030, how it is applicable to other communities, how it is beneficial to the community, and the investment of the community. Discussion followed. Mr. Gordon asked how the board felt about making the decision regarding priority. Mayor Carran suggested the board make a recommendation to the Council and have the Council vote on it. Members discussed making it part of the budget and obtaining Council approval through the budget process. Members also discussed adjusting the project schedule to coordinate with the budget process – November through February.
Following discussion, Mr. Gordon indicated that members didn’t need to vote on the proposed process and that staff would make some refinements based on their comments. Chairman Litzler stated that it was the general consensus of the board that this process is needed and that they are in favor of it.

Chairman Litzler asked for staff’s presentation regarding administration of subdivision regulations across the commonwealth to include a discussion on the cost of providing field inspections to assure required construction standards are met.

Mr. Gordon began by outlining how things are handled outside of Kenton County and stated that planning in Kenton County is unique. He showed the structure of local government that the legislative body used as a template for PDS and outlined the duties for each level. He then modified the structure to reflect the planning structure in Kenton County.

**Planning Outside of Kenton County**

**MAYOR – COUNCIL**

(Duties – accountability, provide direction, set tax rate, approve budget, hire administrator and appoint Planning Commission)

**ADMINISTRATOR**

(Appointed to set policies, provide direction, craft budget, hire staff and provide oversight)

**STAFF/DEPARTMENTS**

(Carry out duties, provide support to Planning Commission, and serve citizens)

**Within Kenton County**

**PDS COUNCIL**

(Duties – accountability, provide direction, set tax rate, approve budget, hire administrator and appoint Planning Commission)

**PDS MANAGEMENT BOARD**

(Appointed to set policies and provide direction)

**EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR**

(Appointed to craft budget, hire staff and provide oversight)

**STAFF/DEPARTMENTS**

(Carry out duties, provide support to Planning Commission, and serve citizens)
Discussion followed regarding the engineering function, inspections, and how they are paid for. Mr. Hiles provided a historical overview since 1989 and outlined how inspection fees were set (length of street and utilities) until 2004. In 2004 calculation was changed at the request of the Land Development Counsel (length of street and number of lots). He stated that the calculation has remained the same since 2004 with only one fee increase in 2008. (A copy of Mr. Hiles PowerPoint presentation is attached to the original minutes).

Mr. Hiles then reviewed the schedule regarding attached, detached, and commercial developments and indicated that he didn’t have historical costs and that information is limited.

Mayor Mattone asked if the HBA approved the calculation and fees. Mr. Hiles stated that the HBA had no problem with it since it occurred during the boom.

Mr. Hiles stated if there were 30 detached lots on 1,000 feet of street, the inspection fee would be $8,300 or $277 per lot and that the fee would vary based on density. Discussion followed.

Mr. Hiles advised members that the actual cost of these inspections was $429 per lot and that the $152 deficit was being paid by Kenton County taxpayers. He stated that the fees are only covering 65% of inspections and the other 35% is being subsidized by tax dollars.

Mayor Carran indicated that when the City of Covington was doing its own building and zoning, the City was subsidizing the program out of its general fund. Discussion followed.

Members asked how these fees compare to Boone County. Mr. Hiles stated that the plan review fee is less than Boone County and that inspection fees are the same. He then reviewed a spreadsheet outlining the cost of various projects done from 2005 through 2015 which showed that taxpayers had subsidized 35% of these projects. Mr. Hiles asked if the 65-35 split was appropriate.

Discussion followed. Mayor Carran stated that developers included marketing costs in their numbers. Mr. Goetz stated that inspections have improved over the years and PDS is doing a better job. Commissioner Sewell stated that developers would pass any increase of inspections fees on to their customers and that taxpayers have been subsidizing on the front end and again on the back end when things fall apart and the cities are making repairs.

Mr. Gordon recommended handling the review/increase of these fees the same as they handled the building permit fee increase a year ago. He indicated that a review committee met with members of the HBA and was able to reach a compromise – 80-20 split. He stated that staff just needs to know what the board thinks is an appropriate split.

Additional discussion followed. Mr. Moriconi stated that with only one increase in 12 years it is no wonder the fees are out of line.
Mr. Hiles indicated that the fee structure is good but the dollar amount is too low and that it would take a 56% increase to cover all costs.

Mayor Carran and Mr. Edmondson excused themselves from the meeting at approximately 5:50 PM.

Commissioner Sewell recommended incremental yearly raises until fees reached 100% of costs. Mr. Kreimborg pointed out that the HBA/developers would get upset with each increase and questioned if it would be better to do it all at once.

Mr. Gordon advised members that he is going to pose the same question to the full Council at next week’s meeting. Commissioner Sewell stated that it will be interesting to see what they say since they are supposed to represent the taxpayers.

Chairman Litzler stated that he believes further discussion on this issue is needed and Mr. Gordon indicated that he would put it on next month’s agenda.

At this point (6:05 PM), members took a 15 minute break during which Mayor Meier rejoined the group.

The meeting resumed at 6:17 PM and discussion of the FY17 budget began. Mr. Gordon provided members copies of the first working draft of the PDS and GIS budgets. He indicated that all revenue has been identified but not all money has been allocated. He stated that the PDS budget is based on the compensating rate. He noted that there is approximately $40,000 additional tax revenue and that there are capital projects that will be paid for out of reserves.

Mr. Gordon advised members that they were scheduled to meet with the Council’s budget review committee on May 9th and that the committee consists of –

Mayor Chris Reinersman, Commissioner Joe Nienaber, Mayor Tyson Hermes, Commissioner Bill Wells, and Mayor Jude Hehman.

Mr. Gordon reviewed page 1, FY17 Projected Revenue Summary, of PDS draft budget line by line and stated that the FY 17 Projected Revenue is up 2% from the FY16-End Estimate. He also noted that the Planning Projects/Studies under contractual Revenue consisted of $11,000 from Villa Hills and $20,000 from additional projects.

Mr. Gordon then reviewed page 6, FY17 Projected Expenditure Summary, line by line. Members questioned the projected salaries and wages. Mr. Gordon checked the figures on the spreadsheet and noted that the numbers for Infrastructure Engineering hadn’t populated. He made the correction in the formula and provided members with the corrected projections.

Members questioned the projected increase in benefits. Ms. Crabb indicated that she has been told to expect a 42% increase for medical coverage due to our move to an ACA compliant plan. A lengthy discussion followed.
Mr. Gordon then reviewed the GIS budget line by line and indicated that the dollars from PDS have yet to be added in to the FY17 Projected Revenue. Discussion followed.

General discussion followed and Mr. Gordon indicated that he would provide members with an updated draft early next week. Members discussed the meeting schedule and Mr. Gordon stated that, if necessary, an additional meeting could be scheduled.

Chairman Litzler asked if there was any additional business to come before the Board.

With no further business, Chairman Litzler adjourned the meeting at 7:45 PM.

______________________________________
Tom Litzler, Chairman

______________________________________
Dennis Andrew Gordon, FAICP
Executive Director/Secretary