Chairman Paul Meier called the monthly business meeting of the Planning and Development Services Management Board to order at 5:17 PM in the Kenton Chambers of the Kenton County Government Center in Covington. Chairman Meier led those gathered in a moment of silence and the Pledge of Allegiance.

Chairman Meier asked Ms. Remley to call the roll. Attendance of members was as follows.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Present</th>
<th>Absent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Chairman Paul Meier</td>
<td>May 2016 through April 2020</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vice Chairman Beth Sewell</td>
<td>May 2017 through April 2021</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Treasurer Tom Litzler</td>
<td>May 2016 through April 2020</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jessica Fette</td>
<td>May 2018 through April 2020</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tyson Hermes</td>
<td>May 2019 through April 2021</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Matt Mattone</td>
<td>May 2016 through April 2020</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gary Waugaman</td>
<td>May 2019 through April 2021</td>
<td>X</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Following the roll call, he asked that the record reflect that a quorum was present.

Also present were: Bruce Applegate, Covington Assistant City Manager; Councilman Gary Meyer, Erlanger; Sharmili Reddy, Fort Mitchell City Administrator; Garry Edmondson, Legal Counsel; Trisha Brush, GISP, Director of GIS Administration; Nicole Cullum, CB, Finance/HR Administrator; Scott Hiles, CPC, Director of Infrastructure Engineering; Emi Randall, AICP, RLA, CFM, Director of Planning and Zoning; Brian Sims, CBO, Chief Building Official; Dennis Andrew Gordon, FAICP, Executive Director; and Lori Remley, Executive Assistant/Office Manager.

**ACCEPTANCE OF AGENDA**

Chairman Meier asked if there were any changes to the agenda. With none, he asked if there was a motion to accept the agenda as presented. Councilman Hermes made a motion to accept the agenda as presented, Mr. Waugaman seconded the motion. A voice vote found unanimous approval.

Chairman Meier asked if there were any comments from the public and noted that there were none.
ONGOING BUSINESS

Chairman Meier asked if the minutes of the December 19, 2019 meeting were acceptable or if there were any additions/corrections.

With no changes, Mayor Fette made a motion to accept the minutes of the December 19, 2019 meeting as presented; Mr. Waugaman seconded the motion. Chairman Meier asked for a voice vote on the motion which found unanimous approval with Commissioner Sewell present but not voting. The motion passed unanimously.

Ms. Cullum reviewed the December financial statement (a copy of which is attached to the original minutes). She reported that, at 50 percent of the way through the fiscal year, revenues are above projections at 67.9 percent, fees for services are above projections at 60.7 percent, and expenses are below projections at 45.7 percent of budget. She noted that One Stop Shop Program revenue is above projections at 60.5 percent with expenses below projections at 47.1 percent.

Ms. Cullum noted one exception – consumable supplies. She also provided an update regarding employee benefit costs and stated that they are up 24% over FY19 and 34% over FY18. She provided information regarding TIF payouts and stated that additional information would be provided once it was received from Mr. Parsons.

With no additional comments, Chairman Meier asked for a motion regarding the December financial report. Mr. Waugaman made a motion to accept the December 2019 financial report subject to audit; Commissioner Sewell seconded the motion. Chairman Meier asked for a roll call vote on the motion which found unanimous approval. The motion passed.

Chairman Meier asked for the report from legal counsel. Mr. Edmondson stated that he had nothing to report but advised the Board that he had been asked by Gallatin County to host a board of adjustment training class on April 7th. This class will be held in Warsaw and will be approximately three hours long; however, the time is still pending. Anyone interested in attending can contact him for more details.

Chairman Meier then asked for review of the executive director’s monthly report. Mr. Gordon stated that he had omitted information from his report. He indicated that he neglected to include GIS staff efforts in his update regarding the planning staff and its new software (enCodePlus). He stated that GIS staff is working with the planners and enCode to link PDS GIS data with the enCode software. He said he also neglected to mention that GIS staff is working with engineering staff on mapping for the Erlanger and Villa Hills asset management projects. Dennis stated that it is all too easy to forget that GIS is constantly working behind the scenes, but almost everything at PDS is GIS based.

Dennis asked if members had any questions regarding his DAGnotes report that he sent to them. There was a brief discussion regarding the two asset management projects. Mr. Hiles advised members that the Villa Hills project would take approximately eight weeks and staff
will inventory curb/sidewalk issues. He stated that the Erlanger project is a similar but larger project including pavement which will take approximately three months to complete.

Chairman Meier asked for staff’s report regarding their review of the proposals submitted for the FY20 salary and wage study. Mr. Gordon stated that staff recommends Graves Consulting from Tulsa, OK as the lowest ($20,220) and best bid. He indicated that there is a big difference in price and that four out of their five references were glowing with no response from the fifth. He suggested taking this recommendation to the Council at next week’s meeting and if there are no objections, staff is asking the Board to authorize him to sign the contract once it has been reviewed by legal counsel.

Commissioner Sewell asked if the money for the study would be pulled from reserves. Mr. Gordon stated that it would not, and that the money is already in the budget.

Chairman Meier asked if there was a motion regarding the proposals and discussion regarding the wording followed. Mr. Waugaman made a motion to submit the Graves bid to the PDS Council for review and, if there are no objections, to authorize the executive director to sign the contract after it is reviewed by legal counsel; Commission Sewell seconded the motion. Chairman Meier asked for a roll call vote that found Mr. Waugaman, Commissioner Sewell, Mayor Fette, Councilman Hermes, and Chairman Meier in favor of the motion. Councilman Hermes noted that there appeared to be some hesitation by Mayor Fette and asked if she had concerns that she wanted to share. Mayor Fette stated that she did not. The motion passed with unanimous approval.

Chairman Meier asked for review of the draft recruitment profile and job announcement for the executive director opening prior to its publication. He noted that the packet was very well put together and asked if members had any comments.

Mayor Fette suggested adding bullet points to make the Job Announcement (page 7) easier to read. Chairman Meier noted that this will be an ad and spacing may be an issue. Mr. Gordon stated that the job description will be posted to the APA website and will have a hyperlink to the rest of the packet. Commissioner Sewell asked when it would be posted. Mr. Gordon indicated that if approved, it would be posted tomorrow. After additional discussion, it was decided to leave the job description in its original “advertisement” format.

Chairman Meier asked if there was a motion regarding the proposal. Mr. Waugaman made a motion to approve the document as presented for posting; Commissioner Sewell seconded the motion.

Chairman Meier asked if there was discussion on the motion. Councilman Hermes asked who would get the resumes. Mr. Gordon indicated that staff would collect them and that it would depend on how much the Board wants to be involved in the process. Mr. Waugaman stated that this should be up to the new members. Commissioner Sewell agreed that they didn’t want to step on anyone’s toes. Chairman Meier asked if they should at least cut the list down at the February 20th meeting. Mr. Waugaman stated that he believes the process should be
started and finished by the new Board, not a third now and two-thirds later. The consensus was that this Board would not take any action and that the new members could call a special meeting if needed.

With no further discussion, Chairman Meier stated that there was a motion on the floor and asked for a voice vote that found unanimous approval. The motion passed.

Chairman Meier provided an update from the Structural Review Committee. He stated that members had been provided with a copy of a packet outlining the committee’s process and outlined the preferred model for re-structure of the Management Board.

**Current structure** - The 20-member Council is made up of elected officials (one representative and one alternate from each member government) and meets four times per year. The Council elects the seven-member Management Board which meets 12 times per year and the members may be non-elected officials.

**Proposed structure** - The 20-member Council would still be made up of elected officials (one representative and one alternate from each member government) but would meet six times per year. The seven-member Management Board would be elected by and from the Council and would still meet 12 times per year. Four board seats would be filled by representatives from the four jurisdictions with populations above 15,000 and their seats would be guaranteed. The other three members would be elected from the remaining Council.

Chairman Meier indicated that the Council will be meeting on January 23rd to adopt its amended bylaws and that the Management Board will adopt its amended bylaws at its February 20th meeting. He stated that this will be a big change for a lot of people but that it has been the same for a long time and maybe it’s time for a change.

Chairman Meier asked for a report regarding the performance review process for the next executive director. Commissioner Sewell stated that the review process has remained the same for years and after Mr. Gordon’s most recent review it was suggested that members look at a different type of review. She indicated that the proposed form is a modified version of what is used in-house for all staff.

Mr. Gordon confirmed that the proposed form has been modified a bit from the one used for all staff members. He noted that the “review” process doesn’t look back but rather looks forward. He reviewed each section of the form and explained how the process works –

**Quarterly Job Performance** - The adjectives – stellar, admirable, acceptable, and unacceptable – were picked by staff to describe their performance.

**Core Values** – Each staff member must make a concerted effort over the fiscal year to meet or exceed the expectations of each of the core values.
**Goals** – Each staff member is involved in the goal setting process and sets the quarter in which the goal is to be completed. The manager and staff member meet quarterly to discuss that status of each goal.

Mr. Gordon stated that this isn’t a typical “review”. Commissioner Sewell indicated that it is more or less a checkup and that she likes this approach better.

Mr. Waugaman stated that this process would allow them to know if the executive director is on track to meet his/her goals, that it would be a good way to track what’s going on and thinks setting goals gives employees incentive.

Members asked the managers present what they thought of the process. Mr. Hiles stated that the process allows them to see where they are and makes it easier to evaluate staff’s performance.

With no additional comments, Chairman Meier stated that the new form should be passed on to the new Board for its use.

**NEW BUSINESS**

Chairman Meier asked for review of the initial revenue projections for the FY21 budget to include discussion on sources Board members want to review in more detail. He noted that the projection for Campbell County Fiscal Court is down a little.

Mr. Gordon advised members that this is the earliest the budget process has been started and that the projections provided are very rough preliminary numbers.

Ms. Cullum stated that these projections are based on the first six months of FY20 and the last six months of FY19. She then began a line by line review of the revenue projections for FY21. She advised Chairman Meier that the Campbell County projection was a bit lower due to a project being put on hold.

Mr. Gordon noted that the Electronic Payment Fees and the New Development Geographic Information Support had not been implemented because the 1.9% CPI increase had already been applied and that the $1 charge would put the fee increase over the agreed upon increase under the interlocal agreement. He stated that staff would need to address this issue with the Council and Mr. Edmondson to see if these fees can be applied this fiscal year. Discussion regarding how best to implement these fees and if the interlocal agreements will need to be redone. Councilman Hermes asked if code enforcement was part of the interlocal agreement. Mr. Gordon stated that it could be if the jurisdiction selected that service. It was agreed that the ILA would probably need to be rewritten. Members discussed the 40% cost to the jurisdictions using code enforcement services. Mr. Waugaman stated that if these costs were increased to 100%, it wouldn’t benefit the jurisdictions to go through PDS, they’d just do their own. Councilman Hermes stated that it wasn’t that easy, but the jurisdiction would have that option. He indicated that, even if the City of Erlanger wanted to join the program, it couldn’t
because PDS wouldn’t be able to handle the extra work without additional staff and doesn’t have the funds to hire additional staff. Mr. Waugaman said that smaller cities can’t afford to have the cost of this service increased by 60%. Councilman Hermes stated that the City of Erlanger shouldn’t have to pay 60% of another jurisdiction’s cost. Mayor Fette indicated that she had presented other options not just increasing to 100%. Chairman Meier stated that PDS would need to look at this issue and would need time if any other jurisdictions wanted to join the program.

Chairman Meier asked if there was any other new business to come before the Board and asked members to attend next Thursday’s Council meeting if they are around. With no other business, Mr. Waugaman made a motion to adjourn the meeting and Councilman Hermes seconded it. With all in favor, the meeting adjourned at 6:45 PM.

_____________________________________
Paul Meier, Chairman

_____________________________________
Dennis Andrew Gordon, FAICP
Executive Director/Secretary